

REGULAR MEETING OF THE BILLINGS CITY COUNCIL

August 10, 2015

The Billings City Council met in regular session in the Council Chambers located on the second floor of the Police Facility, 220 North 27th Street, Billings, Montana. Mayor Thomas W. Hanel called the meeting to order at 6:30 p.m. and served as the meeting's presiding officer. Councilmember Bird gave the invocation.

ROLL CALL: Councilmembers present on roll call were: Cromley, Yakawich, Pitman, Cimmino, Bird, McFadden, McCall, Swanson, Crouch, and Brown.

MINUTES: July 27, 2015: Councilmember Crouch moved for approval, seconded by Councilmember Cromley. On a voice vote, the motion was unanimously approved.

COURTESIES:

- Councilmember Swanson acknowledged that two of his grandsons were visiting from out of town, and were in attendance at this evening's meeting. Councilmember Swanson's wife Nancy was also in attendance. Mayor Hanel thanked Councilmember Swanson's grandsons and wife for attending the meeting.
- Councilmember McCall praised the Parks Department and staff for a successful opening and for the improvements at Pioneer Park. Mayor Hanel asked whether anyone knew when South Park would be having its opening events. Councilmember Cromley stated that the event should be taking place within the next few weeks.
- Councilmember Cromley stated that the Pioneer Park opening was a nice event, that his grandson had been in town visiting as well, and that they enjoyed the opening.
- Councilmember Cimmino thanked Mr. and Mrs. Tim Goodridge for their work and for the success of the Magic City Blues Festival.
- Councilmember Cimmino stated that she was glad to see the completed parking lot and outdoor space at the Library, and asked for Ms. Volek to pass along the compliment to Bill Cochran, Library Director.
- Councilmember Bird noted that Montana Fair is in full swing, and that the ticket value pass is a great deal for attending fair events. Councilmember Bird praised Yellowstone County and Metra Park for the success for the fair.

PROCLAMATIONS:

Mayor Hanel read a proclamation and declared August 14, 2015 to be "Spirit of 45 Day" in remembrance and reflection of military members and of the end of World War II in August 1945.

ADMINISTRATOR REPORTS - TINA VOLEK

City Administrator Tina Volek did not have any items to discuss.

PUBLIC COMMENT on "NON-PUBLIC HEARING" Agenda Item: #1 ONLY.

Speaker sign-in required. (Comments offered here are limited to one (1) minute. Please sign in at the cart located at the back of the council chambers or at the podium. Comment on items listed as public hearing items will be heard ONLY during the designated public hearing time for each respective item. For Items not on this agenda, public comment will be taken at the end of the agenda.)

The public comment period was opened.

There were no speakers, and the public comment period was closed.

1. CONSENT AGENDA

A. Bid Awards:

- 1. Demolition of Airport Old Shop Building.** (Opened 7/28/15) Recommend M.P. Environmental, \$60,920.
- B. Contract with Securitas Security Services USA, Inc., for City parking garages security services (two years with two one-year options to renew); \$39,181/year.**
- C. Development Agreement, public improvements, Elysian School District.**
- D. Development Agreement, public improvements, Lots 2-A-1 and 2-A-2, Block 2, Zimmerman Acreage Tracts, 2nd Filing.**
- E. Approval of Limited Commercial Aviation Building and Ground Lease with Alpine Aviation, Inc. DBA Big Sky Ground Support Industries (8/1/2015 - 07/31/2017); annual revenue first year - \$12,353.52; revenue for subsequent years to be adjusted annually by Consumer Price Index for all Urban Consumers (CPI-U).**
- F. Approval of floor sweeper/scrubber purchase for Billings Operations Center; \$69,859.52.**

- G. **Acceptance of Right of Way Agreement and Warranty Deed for Colton Boulevard (SID 1382) from KZ Bar Limited Partnership.**
- H. **Acceptance of Donation to Billings Fire Department, International Association of Fire Fighters, \$750.**
- I. **Acceptance of Donation to Billings Police Department, Yellowstone County DUI Task Force, \$9,000.**
- J. **Second/Final Reading Ordinance expanding Ward III (Annexation # 15-08)** for approximately 20 acres, located at the southwest corner of Elysia Road and East Lane. Elysian School, owner.
- K. **Second/Final Reading Ordinance expanding Ward IV (Annexation #15-09)** for 3.5 acres generally located on the west side of 46th Street West, just south of the intersection of Rimrock Road and 46th Street West; Eggart Enterprises, LLC and RK Development, LLC, owners.
- L. **Second/Final Reading Ordinance for Zone Change #935:** a zone change from Residential Professional (RP) to Neighborhood Commercial (NC), on a 13,706 square foot parcel of land described as: Lot 9A, Block 2, Justiss Subdivision, and located at 741 S 24th Street West. 741 S 24th Street West, Inc., owner. Approval of the zone change and adoption of the determinations of the ten criteria.
- M. **Second/Final Reading Ordinance for Zone Change #937:** A zone change from Residential 9,600 (R-96) to Residential Professional (RP) on a 35,719 square foot parcel of land described as: C/S 604 and Tract 2 of C/S 356; and located at 100 Emerald Drive. Lois Schroeder, owner. Approval of the zone change and adoption of the determinations of the ten criteria.
- N. **Final Plat of High Sierra Subdivision, 8th Filing.**
- O. **Bills and Payroll:**
 - 1. April 1, 2015 through June 20, 2015 (Municipal Court)
 - 2. July 13, 2015
 - 3. July 20, 2015

Councilmember Brown separated Item 1O3 in order to abstain.

Councilmember Pitman moved to approve the Consent Agenda, with the exception of Item 1O3, seconded by Councilmember Cimmino. On a voice vote, the motion was unanimously approved.

Councilmember Pitman moved to approved Item 1O3, seconded by Councilmember Yakawich. On a voice vote, the motion was approved 10 to 0, with Councilmember Brown abstaining.

REGULAR AGENDA:

2. **PUBLIC HEARING AND RESOLUTION creating Road Maintenance District #6, Estates at Briarwood Subdivisions, 1st and 2nd Filings. Staff recommends approval. (Action: approval or disapproval of staff recommendation.)**

City Administrator Volek stated that staff did not have a presentation for this item, but was prepared to answer questions.

The public hearing was opened.

There were no speakers, and the public hearing was closed.

Councilmember Cromley moved for approval of Item 2, seconded by Councilmember Yakawich. On a voice vote, the motion was unanimously approved.

3. **PUBLIC HEARING AND RESOLUTION granting a tax abatement to D&M Enterprises, Inc., DBA Auto Trim Design and Carnu, for a building construction at 3045 King Avenue West. Staff recommends approval. (Action: approval or disapproval of staff recommendation.)**

Assistant City Administrator Bruce McCandless began a PowerPoint presentation. Mr. McCandless presented an overview of the City's tax incentive programs. Mr. McCandless noted that State law governs tax incentives, but that the City has discretion in deciding which tax incentives to adopt. Mr. McCandless stated that the tax incentives, in relation to construction projects, only offer abatements on the value of the new construction. The Big Sky Economic Development Authority (BSEDA) operates the tax incentive programs for both the City and the County. The City Council, in 2005, adopted a resolution to offer tax incentive programs. Mr. McCandless stated that for construction projects, a minimum cost is required and the tax abatement applies to the value of the new construction only. The abatement would be valid for the four years following construction.

Councilmember Cromley clarified that the property owners will never pay less taxes than they previously paid – they will only receive an abatement for taxes on the new construction portion. Mr. McCandless confirmed Councilmember Cromley's statements and noted that the tax abatements only apply to the increase in value of a property as a result of the new construction.

Councilmember Crouch stated that he appreciated the article in the Billings Gazette that discussed tax abatements. Councilmember Crouch asked whether the City monitors previous promises from businesses, such as promises to increase jobs within the City. Councilmember Crouch gave the example of FedEx promising to create additional jobs in the City if granted a tax abatement. Mr. McCandless stated that he believed that BSEDA monitors these types of details.

Councilmember Cimmino asked whether the City pays taxes to BSEDA. Mr. McCandless stated that there is a small levy which provides taxes to BSEDA. Councilmember Cimmino asked whether, in addition to City taxes and taxes for School District 2, taxes to BSEDA would be abated. Mr. McCandless stated that he did not believe that taxes paid to BSEDA would be abated, and that Yellowstone County actually has control over the tax levies for BSEDA. Mr. McCandless also stated that Yellowstone County has already considered or will be considering tax abatement applications from both D&M Enterprises and Shipton's Big R.

The public hearing was opened.

- **Connie Jones, 1028 Avenue C, Billings, MT, CFO of Rimrock Auto Group** stated that the property in question is actually located at 2951 King Avenue West and that 3045 King Avenue West is the location of Rimrock Auto Group's corporate offices. Ms. Jones stated that Rimrock Auto Group has spent over \$3 million making improvements to this particular building (2951 King Avenue West), including making it more energy efficient. The building is made out of concrete, and the windows are thermal pane glass. Oil heaters were installed into the facility, and used oil collected from the group's dealerships is used to fuel the heaters. LED lighting is also found throughout the building. Ms. Jones noted that the group's sales have increased approximately 17% from last year. Inventory management, sales, and marketing management has improved greatly. Expenses for the group increased 24% from last year. The proposed tax abatement would allow for time to absorb the costs of the building improvements. Ms. Jones stated that Rimrock Auto Group also plans to increase employment by approximately 50%.
- **Chad Moore, Big Sky Economic Development**, stated that the abatement would be a five year incentive. Mr. Moore noted that in order to qualify for abatement, a business must make an improvement valued at \$500,000 or more. Mr. Moore stated that BSEDA tracks performance on promises such as creating jobs and increasing employment. BSEDA tracks this type of data on a yearly basis. Mr. Moore shared that since 2011, the tax incentive programs have created 31.7 full time jobs and 27 part time jobs, and

increased payroll by over \$25 million. D&M Enterprises has, at this building location, created 20 new jobs and is looking to add ten additional jobs. Mr. Moore noted that, in response to Councilmember Crouch's earlier statements, FedEx decided to not move forward with its tax abatement application. Therefore, employment statistics were not tracked. Mayor Hanel asked whether D&M Enterprises had met the required criteria for tax abatement. Mr. Moore replied that it had.

- **Connie Wardell, PO Box 21432, Billings, MT** stated that she opposed the concept of tax abatement. Ms. Wardell stated that services (Police, Fire, Emergency, traffic monitoring) are provided at the location of construction from day one. Ms. Wardell stated that the concept of tax abatement is based on a false assumption and a lack of logic; and that she hoped that future Council members will examine the concept. Ms. Wardell stated that she would appreciate if a Councilmember would pass an initiative to have staff look into the tax abatement issue. Ms. Wardell stated that she is in the process of expanding her own business, and that tax payments are included in her business plan. Ms. Wardell stated that she does not expect other business people and residents to pick up her taxes. Ms. Wardell stated that businesses promise to create jobs in the community, but larger businesses increase employment and take jobs and business away from small businesses. Ms. Wardell stated that Council should revisit the idea of tax abatement. Ms. Wardell stated that the City needs education, and granting tax abatements takes money away from schools. Mayor Hanel asked Ms. Wardell where her business is located. Ms. Wardell stated that her business, a mini-storage business, is located outside of City limits on 64th Street West. Ms. Wardell stated that she would not qualify for City tax abatement, but she will also not be applying for County tax abatement.
- **Kevin Nelson, 4235 Bruce Avenue, Billings, MT** stated that Rimrock Auto Group encompasses Rimrock Cadillac, Rimrock GM, Rimrock Subaru, Rimrock Kia, Mercedes Benz, and naming rights on Metra Park. Mr. Nelson stated that the group purchased the most expensive property in the City and is now coming before Council to have someone else pay its taxes. Mr. Nelson stated that tax abatements are corporate welfare on steroids. Mr. Nelson stated that the tax abatement application was distributed in the Friday packet. Mr. Nelson noted that a tax abatement application must be approved by March in the year the reduction is desired. Mr. Nelson stated that there is not a date listed on the application. Mr. Nelson stated that he feels that the applicant did not comply with the rules of the application process. Mr. Nelson stated that Council should examine whether the applicant followed the rules and deadlines of the application process.

There were no further speakers, and the public hearing was closed.

Mayor Hanel requested that Mr. Moore return for questions. Mayor Hanel asked Mr. Moore whether the tax abatement application process is more in-depth than the summary provided in the Friday Packet. Mr. Moore replied that the process is more in-

depth. Mr. Moore stated that BSEDA works with businesses throughout the application process. BSEDA will identify the project, and construction moves forward. The application is not completed/processed until construction has been completed. Construction in this case was completed in 2015. Therefore, the next deadline for applications is March 2016. Mayor Hanel asked if the construction permit for this project was issued in 2013. Mr. Moore replied that the construction permit was issued in 2013.

Councilmember Brown asked if the tax abatement would begin in 2017 and if the business will pay taxes on the new construction throughout 2016. Mr. Moore replied that the tax abatement would take effect based on the Department of Revenue's assessment.

Councilmember Bird asked Mr. Moore to address Ms. Wardell's comments that tax abatements take money away from schools. Mr. Moore replied that those statements were incorrect: tax money is not taken away from schools, rather it is delayed. Schools will not receive any less money than they currently receive; the additional tax funds brought about by the construction improvements are diverted/delayed until the end of the abatement. Councilmember Bird asked if BSEDA follows-up with companies to ensure that promised jobs were created. Mr. Moore replied that BSEDA follows-up yearly with businesses via certified mail; the businesses fill out an assessment form and BSEDA tracks the responses.

Councilmember Yakawich stated that he assumed that D&M Enterprises has hired a large number of employees, and that producing jobs is an important part of the community. Mr. Moore stated that 21 businesses are currently receiving tax abatement, and the total amount of private investment from those businesses has totaled over \$741 million. Mr. Moore stated that the yearly payroll for those 21 businesses is over \$172 million. The total tax savings during the abatement period for these businesses has been \$1.4 million.

Councilmember Crouch moved for approval of Item 3, seconded by Councilmember Swanson. Councilmember McFadden stated that he looks at tax abatements in a positive manner. Councilmember McFadden stated that the purpose of government is not to rake in every last nickel in taxes from businesses. Councilmember McFadden stated that tax abatements are worthwhile, especially when they result in job creation in the community. Councilmember McCall stated that she supported the motion and that Big Sky Economic Development does tremendous work in this community. Councilmember McCall also stated that public-private partnerships and incentives help keep our economy running. Councilmember Brown stated that he supported the motion as well, and that he does not want to see businesses penalized for following incentive procedures that are already on the books. Councilmember Brown asked to clarify the timing on this particular application (since construction had already been completed, and the application would be approved before the March 2016 deadline). Mr. McCandless replied that he did not receive specific details from the Department of Revenue on the timing of applications and when abatements actually go into effect. Mr. McCandless stated that he believed that

Mr. Moore's earlier statements were correct – the abatement would apply only in the tax years after the application was received and approved. If construction or completion of the project was still taking place after the application was approved, the abatement period would be only that time which remains; the eligible abatement period begins once the application is approved. It is possible that a business could lose a year or more of abatement, for example, if construction was not completed until one year after the abatement application was approved. Mr. McCandless stated that the exemption in this case should take effect on January 1, 2016. City Administrator Volek stated that a Big Sky Economic Development representative would be happy to attend a future work session to further elaborate on the tax abatement program details. Councilmember Brown asked to clarify whether Council was voting to bring forth a public hearing on this tax abatement application. Ms. Volek replied that this meeting was the public hearing for this tax abatement, and that Council would be voting on whether or not to approve the application. On a voice vote, the motion was approved 10 to 1, with Councilmember Cimmino voting in opposition.

4. **PUBLIC HEARING AND RESOLUTION granting a tax abatement to Shipton's Big R Inc., for a building construction at 524 and 525 Jerrie Lane. Staff recommends approval. (Action: approval or disapproval of staff recommendation.)**

City Administrator Volek stated that staff did not have a presentation for this item, but was available to answer questions.

The public hearing was opened.

- **Connie Wardell, PO Box 24132, Billings, MT** stated that five years is the period of an elementary school education. Ms. Wardell stated that \$88,000 is enough to hire one police officer and pay them for five years. Ms. Wardell stated that the money is not free, and that the City needs police officers more than it needs to subsidize businesses.
- **Chad Moore, Big Sky Economic Development** stated that the applicant was unable to attend this evening's meeting. Mr. Moore stated that Shipton's Big R was looking to build this particular store at a location outside of Montana. The tax abatement program was an incentive and determining factor in deciding to build the new store in Billings rather than somewhere else. Mr. Moore stated that 40 full time jobs and 33 part time jobs are anticipated to be created during the five year abatement period, and that \$7.1 million has been invested in the Heights as a result of this store. Councilmember Bird asked whether the incentive for Shipton's to remain in Montana was for only this store, or for all Shipton's stores. Mr. Moore replied that the decision only affected this particular store. Councilmember Brown asked if there are any ramifications if a company promises, as a result of a tax abatement, to create a certain number of jobs and ultimately does not fulfill the promise. Mr. Moore replied that Council has the authority to end

the abatement at its discretion if it feels that promises are not being fulfilled or requirements have not been met. Councilmember Cimmino asked for clarification on Mr. Moore's earlier statements regarding FedEx and its promise to create more jobs in the City. Mr. Moore clarified his earlier statement that FedEx withdrew its tax abatement application and therefore employment statistics were not tracked. Councilmember Cimmino asked whether BSEDA was involved in FedEx's decision to relocate its facility. Mr. Moore stated that BSEDA initiated other conversations with FedEx, and a tax incentive program was mentioned to FedEx, but FedEx was not interested in pursuing it.

- **Kevin Nelson, 4235 Bruce Avenue, Billings, MT** stated that "it wouldn't be so bad if we had other tax available." Mr. Nelson stated that property tax is the main source of revenue in Montana. Mr. Nelson addressed Councilmember McFadden and stated that he wants to "pick the winners and the losers," which amounts to communism. Mr. Nelson stated that other Councilmembers "wasted 20 minutes time" worrying about safety in a previous discussion about annexation. Mr. Nelson stated that tax revenues fund public safety. In response, Councilmember McFadden stated that giving a tax incentive to an expanding enterprise is not communism. Councilmember McFadden also stated that there are other sources of revenue for the state, such as income taxes; the new jobs that are created as a result of the tax incentives, in turn, provide additional income tax revenues. Mr. Nelson stated that a representative of the applicant must appear at the public hearing, and that he believed Council was in violation of the law because a representative from Shipton's Big R was not in attendance.

There were no further speakers and the public hearing was closed.

Councilmember Yakawich moved to approve Item 4, seconded by Councilmember Pitman. Mayor Hanel noted that he appreciated the citizen testimony on the previous two agenda items. Mayor Hanel stated that "you can't take away something you didn't have" in regards to delaying additional tax revenues for schools. Mayor Hanel reminded the audience that the application criteria had been met in both the D&M Enterprises application as well as the Shipton's Big R application, and therefore spoke in favor of the motion. Councilmember Crouch asked for Mr. Moore to return for questions. Councilmember Crouch asked for Mr. Moore to remind Council of the increase in taxes that have resulted from the 21 businesses that were granted tax abatements. Mr. Moore stated that the abatements were mixtures of five and ten year incentives and that the 21 businesses have saved \$1.4 million since their applications were approved. Councilmember Brown asked Mr. Moore to address Mr. Nelson's statement that a representative must be in attendance at the public hearing. Mr. Moore stated that the applicants had fully intended on attending the public hearing, but they were not in attendance. Councilmember Brown asked whether the vote should be postponed until the applicant is present. Mr. McCandless stated that he believed that Mr. Nelson was citing an attachment to the tax incentive resolution that Council

adopted in 2005. Mr. McCandless stated that the exhibit to the resolution was designed to guide staff and applicants through the application process. The resolution establishes the policy/procedure. The resolution is a policy; it is not an ordinance or a law. Mr. McCandless restated that he believed that Mr. Nelson was reading from the attachment to the resolution. Councilmember Swanson noted that the section Mr. Nelson was citing from states that the applicant or a representative of the applicant must be in attendance at the public hearing. Mayor Hanel clarified Councilmember Swanson's statements and asked whether Mr. Moore is considered to be a representative of the applicant. Mr. Moore stated that he represented Shipton's Big R at the public hearing. On a voice vote, the motion was approved 10 to 1, with Councilmember Cimmino voting in opposition.

5. PUBLIC HEARING AND RESOLUTION creating SILMD 318, Summerhill Subdivision. Staff recommends opening and then continuing the public hearing until the August 24 Council meeting. (Action: approval or disapproval of staff recommendation.)

City Administrator Volek stated that during the SILMD creation process, a resolution of intent is one of the first steps to creating the SILMD. The resolution of intent, in this case, stated that the public hearing was to be held on August 10. Staff determined that the August 10 public hearing did not allow enough time for advertising and for the protest period required by state law. Therefore, staff suggested that the public hearing be continued until August 24. Ms. Volek noted that the public hearing advertisements listed August 24 as the public hearing date.

Mayor Hanel asked City Attorney Brent Brooks whether official action needed to be taken to continue the public hearing. Mr. Brooks recommended to Mayor Hanel that he open the public hearing, and then request a motion from Council to continue the public hearing.

The public hearing was opened.

There were no speakers.

Councilmember Cromley moved to approve the recommended action on Item 5, seconded by Councilmember Yakawich. On a voice vote, the motion was unanimously approved, and the public hearing was continued until August 24.

PUBLIC COMMENT on Non-Agenda Items -- Speaker Sign-in required. (Restricted to ONLY items not on this printed agenda. Comments here are limited to 3 minutes. Please sign in at the cart located at the back of the council chambers or at the podium.)

- **Kevin Nelson, 4235 Bruce Avenue, Billings, MT** stated that a couple weeks ago, he presented documents pertaining to street maintenance. Mr. Nelson asked Council if it was going to assess the 180 acres in Briarwood, valued at \$4 million, at the assessed value that the rest of the City pays. Mr.

Nelson stated that the land is not vacant or unimproved. Mr. Nelson stated that failure to assess that land is causing him irreparable financial harm. Mr. Nelson asked who makes the determination of whether land is improved or unimproved. Additionally, Mr. Nelson discussed the rocks surrounding roundabouts in the City. Mr. Nelson stated that the rocks are hazards, and can cause large amounts of damage if a vehicle collides with them. Mayor Hanel stated that Ms. Volek would discuss Mr. Nelson's statements with Public Works Director Dave Mumford. Mayor Hanel also noted that Mr. Mumford had previously explained the assessment of the area in Briarwood. Mayor Hanel and Ms. Volek mentioned that if any Councilmembers had further questions, staff would be happy to answer them. Mayor Hanel again thanked the audience for their participation and comments at this meeting.

COUNCIL INITIATIVES

Councilmember Yakawich moved to schedule a work session discussion on the history and importance of Task Forces and ways that Task Forces may be supported and developed, seconded by Councilmember McCall. On a voice vote, the motion was unanimously approved. Mayor Hanel asked if there was a particular time frame desired for this discussion. Councilmember Yakawich stated that he would like to have the discussion within the next two months. Councilmember Bird stated that two months may be a lofty goal for the discussion, and that she believed the discussion could occur around the first of the year next year. Ms. Volek stated that she will work with staff and determine a realistic time frame. Ms. Volek stated that staff will plan on a two month time frame, and will update Council if additional time is required.

Councilmember Brown moved to schedule a work session discussion on the topic of bypassing landfill fees for demolition projects, seconded by Councilmember Yakawich. Mayor Hanel asked Councilmember Brown if he had a time frame in mind for the discussion. Councilmember Brown stated that he would like to have the discussion sometime in the next three to four weeks. Ms. Volek stated that the next Council work session agenda (August 17) is lengthy. Ms. Volek also noted that MDU would be willing to make a presentation to Council as well. Ms. Volek stated that the landfill is an enterprise fund, and losing revenue would pose a difficulty. Councilmember Yakawich stated that Council could potentially limit the fee bypassing to a certain timeframe. Ms. Volek noted that Council could take that action, however, she did not believe that was what was requested. Councilmember Brown clarified that he thought the topic was worth examining, and that there may be a middle-ground that would be beneficial. Mayor Hanel stated that he was not opposed to having a presentation from staff at a work session. Councilmember Cimmino asked whether staff would be presenting the pros and cons of bypassing fees only in certain districts. Councilmember Brown stated that he would like to learn about the possibilities in all districts, and that he was not certain that the fee bypass could be limited to only certain districts. Councilmember Cromley asked if the fee bypass would be limited to demolition in blighted areas only. Councilmember Brown replied that yes, the discussion would pertain only to demolition in blighted areas. On a voice vote, the motion was unanimously approved.

ADJOURN: There was no further business, and the meeting adjourned at 7:50 pm.

CITY OF BILLINGS

BY: Thomas W. Hanel
Thomas W. Hanel, Mayor

ATTEST:

BY: Billie Guenther
Billie Guenther, City Clerk

